



**CITES Tree Species Programme (CTSP)
Minutes of the Fourth Advisory Committee Meeting**

**Palexpo, Centre de Congrès, Route François-Peyrot 30, CH-1218 Grand-Saconnex,
Geneva, Switzerland, 18 August 2019**

1. Participants

The list of participants can be found in Annex II at the end of this document.

2. Opening and Welcoming remarks

Welcome remarks by the CITES Secretary-General, Ms. Ivonne Higuero followed by a statement by the Head of the European Union delegation, Mr. Jorge Rodriguez-Romero. Ms. Ivonne Higuero introduced the Chair – Mr. Thomas De Meulenaer, Chief, Scientific Services from CITES Secretariat and the Rapporteur - Mr. Atila Seke (CITES Tree Species Programme Assistant).

3. Adoption of agenda

The agenda as contained in Annex I was adopted by consensus.

4. Confirmation of meeting participants

All the participants introduced their names and country of origin or organization.

5. Advisory Committee - ToRs - Membership - *modus operandi*

Terms of Reference of Advisory Committee (AC) was explained by the CTSP Coordinator: To provide guidance and inform AC participants of progress made so far. Also, to discuss issues and challenges and solutions. The programme Coordinator presented the composition of the AC:

One representative from each country and 6 countries from each of the 3 regions, donors, 2 scientists, the CITES Secretariat, 3 regional coordinators and the ITTO Secretariat.

The programme Coordinator asked if there any possible candidates that we can select from Central and South American and Caribbean region. Cuba can become an alternate for that region. Bahamas representative was not there, and it was agreed that the Coordinator would check with the alternate Member from the Bahamas if that country could be replaced by the Cuban representative due to the fact that Cuba has a project that will need to be monitored during the upcoming meetings of the Committee.

6. Briefing of latest updates

i. Progress made since the 3rd Advisory Committee meeting:

The programme Coordinator noted that with the support of Regional Coordinators (RCs), 18 proposals were revised taking into consideration of reviews and recommendations by evaluators. Contracts were arranged in the course of 2018 - 2019.

Kanako Ishii from the ITTO Secretariat informed that the ITTO is producing 3 trade studies for the CITES Secretariat. A consultant was recruited in July 2018 and reported trade patterns and routes for products from CITES-listed tree species in Asia, Central and South America and the Caribbean, and Africa. ITTO also contributed extensively to this work, including in securing access to timely trade statistics. The report on the trade study was submitted to the CITES in April 2019. Hélène Perier from European Commission asked what the framework and mandate for these studies is. The programme Coordinator explained that the purpose of these studies is to continue making progress with the identification of main products found in international trade, that dominate that trade and that are not captured in annotations. This is a long-standing work requested originally by the Plants Committee and that assists the work of revision of annotations carried by tree species listings.

Hélène Perier inquired what were the timelines to complete the studies, what would be the follow-up with ITTO in CITES in relation to the Standing Committee? The programme Coordinator, Ms Sosa Schmidt, answered that the main purpose is to revise the listing of the tree species that are not included yet in the trade listing. CITES has 2 contracts signed with ITTO that are related to this work. ITTO has until late 2020 to fulfil additional work and there will be a document (probably an information document) submitted to the PC25, this work can also feed the work of the SC working group on annotations and in any case, all reports will be published on the CTSP website as soon as they become available.

Progress reports from some of the partners:

Guatemala (Abimael Reynoso) – Presented the tri-national project with El Salvador, Guatemala, Nicaragua. They started the project on capacity building and management plans targeting *Dalbergia* spp. The plan was to start in January 2019, but because of late payment, they started during June. Also, during June and July, they presented the project to the 3 Governments and got great support from them. In August 2019 they will start the fieldwork by hiring for each separate country a forest expert. They are grateful for the support of the whole CITES team and especially the programme Coordinator. They will need around 2 more months to fulfil the calendar plan that was proposed in the contract.

Gabon (Aurélie Flore)– Questioned when will the fund's transfer start? The programme Coordinator confirmed that the funds were already disbursed on 27 July 2019.

Argentina (Vanessa Tossenberger) – Argentina also has an issue with the late fund transfer. While waiting for the funds they developed the management plan and it was approved by all authorities and now it is being inserted into a national strategic plan for the conservation of *Bulnesia sarmientoi*. This will allow them to follow better the traceability of different parts of trees. Argentina asked if they can adjust their calendar because of the delay in the payment.

Malaysia (Kamarul Ikram Abdul Halim) – Thanked European Union and CITES for making this project possible. The project is under implementation in Malaysia currently. Due to the delay of the fund transfer they hope that CITES will consider an extension of the project.

Brazil (Igor Andrade Vidal Barbosa) - The project did not start yet, they have an issue with the transfer of funds taking more than 7 months.

Cote d'Ivoire (Salimata Kone) – They are also waiting for the transfer of funds, but the implementing agency appointed a coordination team in the meantime.

Nigeria (Ayuba Turman Bakut) – Asked what is the cause of the delay of the transfer of funds? Mr. Ayuba took the opportunity to encourage the acceleration of funds disbursement.

ii. Progress made with the preparation of contracts and pending matters.

Thomas De Meulenaer - Confirmed that the Secretariat got the first instalment of 3 million euro from EC. He acknowledged that bureaucracy in the disbursement of funds system remains a challenge with all UNEP projects. He explained that each project was tailor-made and added that this is the first time that the CITES Secretariat is implementing this kind of project and it is going through the learning process. Extending the timeframe will be necessary. De Meulenaer

was impressed that most of the countries have started to implement some of the activities under their projects which he found very encouraging.

European Commission (EC) - H  l  ne Perier, Policy Officer, Biodiversity, DG Environment - The plan was that the programme would run until 2021. The contract between the EC and the CITES Secretariat was signed in May 2017 and it also took colleagues in EC a long time to find the right framework to sign the agreement. Colleagues in the CITES Secretariat are doing their best and the EC is looking for possibilities for an extension.

Mr. Thang Chiew – Reported on the progress made in Asia – Two countries have already received the first instalments. These two countries are Malaysia and Viet Nam and they started working on internal regulations. We are waiting for the Indonesian authorities to sign their contract soon.

Jean-Lagarde Betti – Explained that he is responsible for 12 countries and 8 projects in total for those countries. Out of those twelve countries, there are two tri-national projects. Tri-national projects are agreements where there are 3 countries cooperating on one project. So far funds were received by Kenya, Tanzania-Uganda (that have a tri-national project) and by Madagascar. He confirmed that during September and October all projects in Africa will be under implementation.

7. Funding process

Ms Sosa, Regional Coordinator for Central and South America, and the Caribbean reported that only Guatemala received funds. Argentina is receiving funds via UNDP-Argentina and that transfer is taking longer than expected. Cuba has the shortest project of only 1 year and this contract will be signed soon. The main challenge is with the disbursement of the funds for Brazil and this is being taken care off as we talk.

8. Discussion on agenda items 6. and 7

The programme Coordinator explained that most of the Parties will receive amendments to extend their contracts to ensure sufficient time is allocated to each project and it is not affected by a late start due to delays with the transfer of the funds. The contract between the EC and the CITES Secretariat will be also extended in order to run longer so that all participating Parties have enough time to finish their projects on time.

16 contracts have been signed already and 10 transfer of funds has been disbursed by now.

It is important to communicate effectively with regional coordinators in order to achieve strengthened efficiency.

The programme Assistant presented on the screen an excel sheet. This list is included below in annex and from this table, it is exactly visible what are the dates of the contracts signing and payments status for each partner.

9. CTSP web-site

The programme Coordinator – Presented the website explaining the main sections and links. The goal was to create a user-friendly website. Easy access to outputs and information. The site is in English at this stage and the French and Spanish versions will be also available soon. The website will be launched officially hopefully by the end of the year 2019.

10. Time and venue of the 5th Advisory Committee meeting

The 5th Advisory Committee of the CTSP meeting will be held during the 55th Session of the International Tropical Timber Council (ITTC-55) and Sessions of the Associated Committees taking place from 2 - 7 December, in Lome, Togo.

11. Closure of meeting

Ms. Sosa Schmidt, the programme Coordinator, thanked all participants for attending and closed the meeting.



**Fourth Advisory Committee Meeting
CITES Tree Species Programme (CTSP)**

18 August 2019

Physical meeting conducted in the margins of the 18th meeting of the Conference of the Parties to CITES

**Fourth meeting of the Advisory Committee of the CITES Tree Species Programme
18 August 2019 in the Palexpo, Centre de Congrès, Route François-Peyrot 30, CH-1218 Grand-Saconnex,
Geneva, Switzerland
Room G
12.15 pm to 14.00 pm
Agenda**

Opening

CITES Secretary General Ivonne Higuero

Welcoming remarks

Ms. Milena Sosa Schmidt, Coordinator of the CTSP at the CITES Secretariat.

1. Confirmation of:
 - a- Chair: Ms. Milena Sosa Schmidt
 - b- Rapporteur: Mr. Atila Seke
2. Adoption of agenda.
3. Confirmation of meeting participants.
4. Advisory Committee - ToRs - Membership - *modus operandi* – to note.
5. Briefing of latest updates.
 - (i) Progress made since the 3rd Advisory Committee meeting;
 - (ii) Progress made with the preparation of contracts and pending matters.
6. Funding process.
7. Discussion on agenda items 5. and 6.
8. CTSP web-site
9. Regional/International workshops.
10. Any other business.
11. Time and venue of the 5nd Advisory Committee meeting.
12. Closure of meeting.

List of participants

1	Ms.	Vanesa Patricia	TOSSENBERGER	Government of Argentina
2	Mr.	Motsereganye	SEKGOPO	Government of Botswana
3	Mr.	Igor	ANDRADE VIDAL BARBOSA	Government of Brazil
4	Mr.	Nero	FERREIRA	Government of Brazil
5	Mr.	Ken	FARR	Government of Canada
6	Ms.	Virginie-Mai	HO	Government of Canada
7	Ms.	Salimata	KONE	Government of Côte d'Ivoire
8	Mr.	José Alberto	ALVAREZ LEMUS	Government of Cuba
9	Ms.	Helene	PERIER	Government of European Union
10	Mr.	Jorge	RODRIGUEZ-ROMERO	Government of European Union
11	Ms.	Aurélie Flore	KOUMBA PAMBO	Government of Gabon
12	Mr.	Juan Francisco Jnior	GARCÍA VASQUEZ	Government of Guatemala
13	Mr.	Cándido Abimael Reinoso Lopez	ASOREMA	Government of Guatemala
14	Ms.	Sri	RATNANINGSIH	Government of Indonesia
15	Ms.	Tika	DEWI ATIKAH	Government of Indonesia
16	Ms.	Dewi Sri Yulita	KUSUMA	Government of Indonesia
17	Mr.	Hasan	Kleib	Government of Indonesia
18	Mr.	Antonio	MORELLI	Government of Italy
19	Mr.	Kamarul Ikram	ABDUL HALIM	Government of Malaysia
20	Mr.	Abdul Rahman	ABDUL AZIZ	Government of Malaysia
21	Mr.	Md Yusoff	ISMAIL	Government of Malaysia
22	Mr.	René Salvador	CASTELLÓN	Government of Nicaragua
23	Mr.	Ayuba Turman	BAKUT	Government of Nigeria
24	Ms.	Fabiola	NUÑEZ NEYRA	Government of Peru
25	Mr.	Harol	GUTIERREZ PERALTA	Government of Peru
26	Ms.	Duangduen	SRIPOTAR	Government of Thailand
27	Ms.	Sumalee	THONGDONAE	Government of Thailand
28	Mr.	Zawadi	MBWAMBO	Government of United Republic of Tanzania
29	Ms.	Shelley	GARDNER	Government of United States of America
30	Mr.	John	VEREMIS	Government of United States of America
31	Mr.	Charles	BARBER	World Resources Institute
32	Ms.	Karen	WINFIELD	Conservation Analytics
33	Ms.	Meaghan	PARKER-FORNEY	World Resources Institute

List of AC members with contacts:

Asia		
Cambodia*	Indonesia*	Vietnam*
<p>Prof. Dr. Nao Thuok</p> <p>Secretary of State of the Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries (MAFF)</p> <p>Chairman of Cambodia CITES Management Authority</p> <p>200 Preah Norodom Boulevard</p> <p>Sangkat Tonle Basak Khan</p> <p>Chamkarmon</p> <p>PHNOM PENH</p> <p>Tel: +855 (12) 404 727; +855 (23) 726 128 / 726 129</p> <p>Fax: +855 (23) 217 320</p> <p>Email: cambodiacitesmaff@gmail.com</p>	<p>Indra Exploitasia (Mrs) - Director of Biodiversity Conservation</p> <p>CITES Management Authority of Indonesia</p> <p>Directorate of Biodiversity Conservation</p> <p>7th Floor, Block VII, Manggala</p> <p>Wanabakti Building</p> <p>Jalan Gatot Subroto</p> <p>Jakarta 10270</p> <p>Tel: 021-5720227</p> <p>Fax: 5720227</p> <p>E-mail: macites@menlhk.go.id, subditkonvensi.kkh@gmail.com dirkkh@menlhk.go.id</p>	<p>Mr. Vuong Tien Manh</p> <p>Deputy Director</p> <p>Viet Nam CITES Management Authority</p> <p>Administration of Forestry</p> <p>Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development</p> <p>B9 Building</p> <p>No. 02 Ngoc Ha st., Ba Dinh dist., Hanoi</p> <p>Vietnam</p> <p>Tel: + 84 24 3733 5676</p> <p>Fax: + 84 24 3734 6742</p> <p>Email: cites_vn.kl@mard.gov.vn; hyderabadmanh@gmail.com</p>
India*	Malaysia*	Thailand*
<p>Mr. Roul Kullai</p> <p>Deputy Inspector General of Forest Wildlife Division,</p> <p>Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change (MoEF&CC) V-619</p> <p>Indira Paryavaran Bhawan,</p> <p>Jor Bag Road, Aliganj,</p> <p>New Delhi 110 003</p> <p>INDIA</p> <p>+91 11 24695233</p>	<p>Mr. Dato' Wan Mazlan Wan</p> <p>Mahmood</p> <p>Undersecretary</p> <p>Biodiversity and Forestry Management Division</p> <p>Ministry of Water, Land and Natural Resources (KATS)</p> <p>wmazlan@kats.gov.my ; citesmalaysia@kats.gov.my</p>	<p>Mr. Somkiat Soontornpitakool</p> <p>Director of CITES Management Authority of Thailand</p> <p>Department of National Parks, Wildlife and Plant Conservation,</p> <p>61, Paholyothin Rd, Chatuchak,</p> <p>Bangkok 10900,</p> <p>Thailand</p> <p>Tel/Fax: (66)2 9406449</p> <p>E-mail: somkiat.sk@hotmail.com</p>

<p>www.moef.nic.in ; www.in.undp.org www.egreefoundation.org roul.kullai@nic.in</p>		
Africa		
<p style="text-align: center;">Gabon*</p> <p>Mr. Brice Léandre Meye Directeur Général de la Faune et des Aires Protégées</p> <p style="text-align: center;">meyebrice@yahoo.fr</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Tanzania</p> <p>Dos Santos Silayo Tanzania Forest Agency CE Department of Forest Engineering, Sokoine University of Agriculture, P.O Box 3012, Chuo Kikuu, Morogoro, Tanzania Telephone (Mobile): +255 784 402162, and +255 718 524470</p> <p style="text-align: center;">dsilayo@yahoo.co.uk santos@suanet.ac.tz</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Côte d'Ivoire*</p> <p>Ms. Salimata Kone, Ministère des Eaux et Forêts - Direction de la Faune et des Ressources Cynégétiques Tour C, 7ème étage - BP V 178 Abidjan - Tél+ 225 2t 21A7 00 - dfrcminef@yahoo.fr ; kosalikk@yahoo.fr</p>
<p style="text-align: center;">Cameroon*</p> <p>Mr. Daniel Amendé Ministère des Forêts et Faune, BP 34430, Yaoundé, Cameroun, phone: +237 6 76657495, danielpiplies@yahoo.fr</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Madagascar*</p> <p>Mr. Liva Ramiandrivo, Organe de Gestion CITES, Secrétaire Général du Ministère de l'Environnement, de l'Ecologie et des Forêts + (261) 34 05 620 48 hariniainaliva@gmail.com robsomanitrandasana@gmail.com m</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Senegal</p> <p>Mr. Abba Sonko, Direction des Eaux et Forêts, Chasses et de la Conservation des Sols/Organe de Gestion C ITES au Sénégal Phone: +221 33 831 01 01 ; Mobile : +221 77 537 43 11,E- abbasonko@hotmail.com</p>
Central, South America and the Caribbean		
<p style="text-align: center;">Brazil*</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Guatemala*</p> <p style="text-align: center;">César Augusto Beltetón</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Argentina</p>

<p>Natalia Milanezi Autoridad Administrativa CITES</p> <p>Biodiversidade e Florestas Coordenação de Comércio Exterior Coordenadora</p> <p>+55 61 331 61258 / 1370 Natalia.milanezi@ibama.gov.br</p>	<p>Scientific Authority CITES Consejo Nacional de Áreas Protegidas – CONAP</p> <p>5a, avenida 6-06, Edificio IPM, Sexto Nivel, Zona 1. Apartado Postal 01001 Ciudad de Guatemala – Guatemala</p> <p>M: + 502 47 597181 cesarbelte@gmail.com</p>	<p>Mr Eduardo Manghi Coordinator 26.311 National Law Implementation Unit National Native Forest Dept. Secretariat of Environment and Sustainable Development</p> <p>San Martín 451 – Ciudad Autónoma de Buenos Aires - C.P. 1004 - Argentina</p> <p>+54 11 4348-8200 citesargentina@ambiente.gob.ar; edramadori@ambiente.gob.ar emanghi@ambiente.gob.ar</p>
<p>Perú*</p> <p>Ms. Irma Betty Romero Rodriguez Autoridad Administrativa CITES Dirección de Gestión Sostenible del Patrimonio Forestal</p> <p>Avenida 7 Nro. 229, Urb. Rinconada Baja La Molina. Lima – Perú + 511 2259005 Anx.: 148 Mobile: +51 994 699 985</p>	<p>Bahamas</p> <p>Ms. Danielle Hanek MSc.Forest Officer Forestry Unit Ministry of the Environment and Housing</p> <p>+ 242 322-4546 daniellehanek@bahamas.gov.bs</p>	<p>Nicaragua</p> <p>Mr. René Salvador Castellón Autoridad Administrativa CITES Ministerio del Ambiente y Recursos Naturales (MARENA)</p> <p>Kilómetro 12 1/2 Carretera Norte Apartado No. 5123 MANAGUA</p> <p>Tel: +505 (2) 33 11 13 Fax: +505 (2) 33 11 13 Nicaragua rcastellon@marena.gob.ni citesni@marena.gob.ni</p>
Programme donor representatives		
European Commission-Helene Perrier		

Mr. François Busson
Policy Officer - Forestry and Biodiversity
European Commission
International Cooperation and Development
Unit C2 – Environment, Natural Resources, Water
Francois.BUSSON@ec.europa.eu

United States of America-Shelley Gardner
Ms. Anne St. John
Biologist
Division of Management Authority
U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service
anne_stjohn@fws.gov

CITES TREES SPECIES PROGRAMME TEAM

Evaluators/Scientists

Mr. Ian Thompson
Thompson Forest Consulting Inc.
ian.thompsonforest@gmail.com

Mr. Jorge Malleux
Consultor forestal Internacional
Profesor Emérito Universidad Nacional Agraria - La
Molina Lima Perú
jmalleux@gmail.com

CITES Secretary General

Ms. Ivonne Higuero
Secretary-General/Secretaria General/Secrétaire Générale
CITES Secretariat/Secretaría CITES/Secrétariat CITES

+41 22 917 2347 (fixed)
+41 76 691 1095 (mobile)
ivonne.higuero@cites.org

Postal address:
CITES Secretariat
Palais des Nations
Avenue de la Paix 8-14,
1211 Genève 10,
Switzerland
Street address:

Maison Internationale de l'Environnement

15 Chemin des Anémones

1219 Châtelaine-Genève

Switzerland

CITES Secretariat Tree Species Programme Coordinator and Programme Assistant

Ms. Milena Sosa Schmidt

CITES Tree species programme Coordinator

E: milena.schmidt@cites.org

T: +41 (22) 917 8434 , M : +41 79 5521507

Postal address:

CITES Secretariat

Palais des Nations

Avenue de la Paix 8-14,

1211 Genève 10,

Switzerland

Street address:

Maison Internationale de l'Environnement

15 Chemin des Anémones

1219 Châtelaine-Genève

Switzerland

Mr. Atila Seke

Programme Assistant

E: atila.seke@cites.org

T: +41 (22) 917 9036 , M : +41 77 9873235

Postal address:

CITES Secretariat

Palais des Nations

Avenue de la Paix 8-14,

1211 Genève 10,

Switzerland

Street address:

Maison Internationale de l'Environnement

15 Chemin des Anémones

1219 Châtelaine-Genève

Switzerland