



CITES Tree Species Programme

Minutes of the 3rd Advisory Committee Meeting

Yokohama, Japan

Wednesday, 7 November 2018, 13:00 – 14:00

1. List of Participants

Mr. Patrice Moussy (European Union)
Ms. Gabriela Resendes (Brazil)
Mr. Chheang Dany (Cambodia)
Ms. Victoire Eheth (Cameroon)
Mr. Bruno Arias (Guatemala)
Mr. André Bosch (Guatemala)
Ms. Ary Sri Lestari (Indonesia)
Mr. Sya'roni Agung Wibisono (Indonesia)
Ms. Yulita Kusumadewi (Indonesia)
Mr. Luu Tien Dat (Viet Nam)
Mr. Hoang Lien Son (Viet Nam)
Mr. Ngo Sy Hoai (Viet Nam)
Ms. Cindy Squires (IWPA)
Mr. Robert Tate (Papua New Guinea Forest Industries Association)
Ms. Milena Sosa-Schmidt (CITES Secretariat)
Mr. Steven E. Johnson (ITTO Secretariat)
Ms. Kanako Ishii (ITTO Secretariat)

2. Opening and selection of Chair/Rapporteur

Ms. Milena Sosa-Schmidt (CITES) welcomed participants to the 3rd Advisory Committee (AC) meeting under the CITES Tree Species Programme in Yokohama, Japan, being convened in conjunction with the Fifty-fourth Session of the International Tropical Timber Council (ITTC). She gave participants customized WhyNote reusable sticky notes and explained how eco-friendly these notes could be used. Ms. Ishii (ITTO) agreed to take notes to assist in preparing the minutes.

3. Agenda

The agenda as contained in Annex I was adopted by consensus.

4. Confirmation of meeting participants

5. Advisory Committee – ToRs – Membership – *modus operandi* – to note

Ms. Sosa-Schmidt referred participants to the Terms of Reference of AC (Annex II) and a list of designated AC members (Annex III), as per advice by the European Commission. Due to budgetary constraints, Regional Coordinators were unable to attend the AC meeting. Ms. Sosa-Schmidt reminded participants that any industry stakeholders are welcome to attend the AC meeting(s) as observers.

6. Briefing of latest updates

- (i) Progress made since the 2nd Advisory Committee meeting (Annex IV);

Ms. Sosa-Schmidt briefed participants how submitted project proposals had been evaluated by four (4) parties and by the Advisory Committee as follows:

- a) Two (2) designated scientists, Mr. Ian Thompson (Canada) and Mr. Jorge Malleux (Peru) had a month time to assess and provide an evaluation of each proposal;
 - b) Further evaluation was carried out by both CITES and ITTO;
 - c) Final evaluation was carried out by the Advisory Committee which provided comments and recommendations ;
 - d) Some proponents were required to re-write proposals, taking into consideration recommendations made by the above pertinent parties;
 - e) Regional Coordinators assisted proponents to finalize proposals. The Programme regional meeting for Asia was convened in Yogyakarta, Indonesia, from 25 to 29 June 2018 where bilateral meetings among CITES/ITTO, Regional Coordinator with stakeholders took place to accelerate the process to finalize proposals for that region.
- (ii) 17 out of 18 full project proposals were ready and submitted to the CITES Secretariat by 31 July 2018. In August, drafting contracts commenced with inputs from the scientific/legal/finance teams inside the Secretariat.
- (iii) Progress made with the preparation of contracts and pending proposals.

On 18 October 2018, the legal team at the CITES Secretariat approved all contracts, pending the final unit of administration to send out contracts to each relevant country. Ms. Sosa-Schmidt announced that the new Secretary General (SG) of the CITES would arrive on 23 November 2018 and hopefully short after that time she would be able to sign all the contracts.

7. Funding process, and discussion on agenda items above.

Ms. Sosa-Schmidt explained to the participants that transfer of funds would take 21 steps and urged relevant countries to sign their contracts as soon as possible after receiving two original signed copies from the CITES Secretariat. She stressed the urgency in commencing projects with specific seasons to do field work and sampling.

Mr. Chheang Dani (Cambodia) requested the CITES Secretariat to share a draft contract while waiting for the original to arrive with the signature of the SG. Ms. Sosa-Schmidt took note of the comment, however, reminded participants that the format would not be changeable as it is provided by UNEP. She said that some countries can't open a bank account until the contracts have been signed and since the bank account information is required in the contract template, CITES is looking into solutions to complete those contracts.

Ms. Yulita Kusumadewi (Indonesia) made an enquiry on possible amendments to 'property rights' in the contract. Ms. Sosa-Schmidt repeated that the UNEP will not allow changes to the text, however, an official letter issued by the Government of Indonesia, requesting to such a change may be submitted to the CITES Secretariat so consultations with the legal team can seek a compromise.

Ms. Victoire Eheth (Cameroon) questioned current status of the project submitted by Cameroon as 'under discussion'. Ms. Sosa-Schmidt that there is a need to revise the budget as paying salaries with the programme's funds to governmental officials is not allowed. She also raised the similar issue in Indonesia for payment to retired governmental officials who are under pension scheme but don't work for the Government anymore. Mr. Patrice Moussy (European Union) confirmed the financial regulation would not allow to pay salaries to active Government officials, however, he promised to check about payment to 'retired' governmental officials. Ms. Yulita Kusumadewi (Indonesia) confirmed with Ms. Sosa-Schmidt that inclusion of transport costs and DSA in the project budget is possible.

Mr. Steven E. Johnson (ITTO) questioned the long time that is being taken to complete signing contracts by all parties. Ms. Sosa-Schmidt replied that hopefully contracts would be signed in December 2018 because transfers

of funds after January 2019 will be more complex. All agreed that contracts need to be complete and signed by the end of the year.

Mr. Patrice Moussy (European Union) sought for possibility for countries to start implementation of projects without their contract signed by relevant parties. Ms. Sosa-Schmidt informed participants that the contract needs to be in PDF to upload in the system for disbursing the first installment to project executing agencies.

Mr. Chheang Dany (Cambodia) pointed out that the field work in Cambodia is in October and since that contract was not signed earlier now the project team needs to wait until October 2019 to do that work; considering that project is of 24-month, it will not be completed by the end of 2021. Ms. Sosa-Schmidt reminded participants that all projects need to be completed by 2021 and if projects start in January 2019, there should not be any problem, however, some cases such as the project in Cambodia need to have an extension and there are 7 or 8 projects on a similar situation. Cambodia expressed concerned and said that taking 5 months, from July to November, to sign a contract is not a healthy procedure. Mr. Steven E. Johnson (ITTO) informed the AC of possible budget neutral extension which is usually indicated in the contract and advised the CITES Secretariat to request the EC for such a permission, if necessary. He further questioned how many installments are arranged for projects, and to that, Ms. Sosa-Schmidt informed the AC that a lengthy internal discussion led to the first installment as 60% of the total followed by 20% upon submission of the first progress report and the last 20% upon submission of a financial report. Mr. Johnson drew attention to the fact that the last installment would not occur until the implementation of the project is complete. Ms. Sosa-Schmidt concurred and explained that the CITES Secretariat team is aware that all participating countries need the most of the funds for the 1st installment to set up the structure of the projects and do the launching work which is usually in the field.

8. Regional/International workshops

Mr. Steven E. Johnson (ITTO) informed the AC that ITTO was contracted under the CITES Tree Species Programme to organize 3 regional meetings and so far the following meetings were convened:

- a) Regional meeting in Asia – Yogyakarta, Indonesia, from 25 to 29 June 2018. Proponents attended the meeting to share project proposals and intensive consultation was convened to finalize proposals with assistance of Regional Coordinator for Asia, Mr. Thang Hooi Chiew; and
- b) Regional meeting for Central & South America and the Caribbean - Buenos Aires, Argentina, from 17 to 21 September 2018.

At both regional meetings, a trade study on target species for each region was presented and Mr. Johnson reported to the AC that limited data is available for some species and that difficult to grasp the trade pattern. He further explained that there was a recommendation to CITES on improving the trade database reporting units of traded products.

Mr. Johnson announced the AC that the third and final regional meeting for Africa will be convened in Tanzania in March 2019, hoping that projects underway by that time to receive progress reports at the meeting.

9. Time and venue of the 4nd Advisory Committee meeting.

Ms. Milena Sosa-Schmidt (CITES) informed the AC that the CITES was in discussions with ITTO for the latter to possibly organize the next AC4 meeting in conjunction with the CITES CoP18 in Sri Lanka from 23 May to 3 June 2019. At the AC4, all members and alternates will be invited to strengthen communications between all and encourage further cooperation. She further indicated there is an intention to convene an international meeting, if funding is available, referring to great outcomes derived from the former international meeting convened in January 2013 in Bali, Indonesia.

10. Closure of meeting.

Ms. Sosa-Schmidt thanked all participants for attending and closed the meeting.

Annex I



Third Advisory Committee Meeting CITES Tree Species Programme (CTSP)

7 November 2018

Physical meeting conducted in the margins of the 54th Session of the International Tropical Timber Council and Associated Sessions of the Committees

International Tropical Timber Organization (ITTO)
International Organizations Center - 5th Floor
Pacifico-Yokohama, 1-1-1, Minato-Mirai, Nishi-ku, Yokohama, 220-0012 Japan

Room 513
12.40 pm to 1.50 pm

Agenda

Welcoming remarks

Ms. Milena Sosa Schmidt, Coordinator of the CTSP at the CITES Secretariat.

1. Confirmation of:
 - a- Chair: Ms. Milena Sosa Schmidt
 - b- Rapporteur: Ms. Ishii Kanako
2. Adoption of agenda.
3. Confirmation of meeting participants.
4. Advisory Committee - ToRs - Membership - *modus operandi* – to note.
5. Briefing of latest updates.
 - (i) Progress made since the 2nd Advisory Committee meeting;
 - (ii) Most of the full project proposals ready and submitted to the CITES Secretariat by 31 July 2018;
 - (iii) Progress made with the preparation of contracts and pending proposals.
6. Funding process.
7. Discussion on agenda items 5. and 6.
8. Regional/International workshops.
9. Any other business.
10. Time and venue of the 4nd Advisory Committee meeting.
11. Closure of meeting.

Annex II

CITES Tree Species Programme – **Advisory Committee** Terms of Reference

1. **Mandate and key tasks**

An Advisory Committee is established to support the implementation of the CITES Tree Species Programme, and provide non-binding strategic and technical advice.

The tasks of the Advisory Committee will include the following:

- Provide guidance on the roadmaps produced by the regional coordinators.
- Provide advice and input on proposal applications.
- Be informed about and comment on the overall progress of the implementation of programme.
- Discuss issues and challenges identified by the programme team and implementers, and propose remedial actions, as appropriate.

The Advisory Committee findings and recommendations may be reported by the CITES Secretariat to both donors and to the CITES official bodies.

2. **Composition**

The Advisory Committee consists of the following:

- Three Party representatives from each of the three CITES regions concerned by the programme (Africa; Asia; Central and South America and the Caribbean).
- Programme donor representatives
- Two scientists
- CITES Secretary General (Chair)¹
- CITES Tree Species Programme Coordinator and Programme Assistant (Secretary to the Advisory Committee)
- Three Regional Coordinators
- ITTO Secretariat (*ex officio*).

Effort will be made to ensure that the Advisory Committee remains small and flexible, whilst ensuring effectiveness and regional balance. A minimum of one Party representative from each of the three CITES regions concerned by the programme (Africa; Asia; Central and South America and the Caribbean); one donor, and the CITES Secretariat will form a quorum for conducting physical meetings.

Additional members to the Advisory Committee may join at a later stage by agreement. The number of donors present in each meeting cannot outnumber the number of Party representatives.

All members to the Advisory Committee will contribute on a voluntary basis and will self-finance their participation at physical meetings.

3. **Modus operandi**

The Advisory Committee will conduct its work mostly through email exchange. The CITES Tree Species Programme Coordinator will ensure that information is shared among the Advisory Committee members. A dedicated programme webpage will be created and maintained to share relevant programme information and to facilitate communication with the Advisory Committee.

These will be closed meetings. In the case that another Party observer would like to attend a particular meeting, that will need to be considered in advance by the Advisory Committee members and, on a case by case basis.

¹ For the entire duration of this project and to be reconsidered at a later stage.

Subject to financial availability, the Advisory Committee will aim to meet face-to-face on an opportunistic basis in the margins of CITES official and other relevant meetings.

At the beginning of each Advisory Committee meeting, the Chair will present the agenda and invite a round of self-introduction of participants. The assistant of the programme will take notes of discussions and prepare minutes that will be shared with all participants.

Rules of procedure may be adopted, if necessary, to help with a smooth running of each meeting.

Annex III

List of Advisory Committee members

Asia		
Cambodia*	Indonesia*	Vietnam*
Mr. Ty Sokhun Chairman CITES Management Authority of Cambodia Secretary of State Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries (MAFF)	Mr. Bambang Dahono Adji Director of Biodiversity Conservation CITES Management Authority of Indonesia Directorate of Biodiversity Conservation	Mr. Vuong Tien Manh Deputy Director Viet Nam CITES Management Authority Administration of Forestry Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development
India*	Malaysia*	Thailand*
Mr. Tarun Kathula Wildlife Division, Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change (MoEF&CC)	Mr. Megat Sany Megat Ahmad Supian Undersecretary Biodiversity and Forest Management Department Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment (NRE)	Mr. Somkiat Soontornpitakool Director of CITES Management Authority of Thailand Department of National Parks, Wildlife and Plant Conservation
Africa		
Gabon*	Tanzania	Côte d'Ivoire*
Mr. Brice Léandre Meyé Directeur Général de la Faune et des Aires Protégées	Chief Executive, Tanzania Forest Services Agency (TFS)	Ms. Salimata Kone, Ministère des Eaux et Forêts - Direction de la Faune et des Ressources Cynégétiques
Cameroon*	Madagascar*	Senegal
Mr. Martin Mbongo, point focal Organe de gestion CITES flore du Cameroun, Ministère des Forêts et Faune	Mr. Liva Ramiandrarivo, Organe de Gestion CITES, Secrétaire Général du Ministère de l'Environnement, de l'Ecologie et des Forêts	Mr. Abba Sonko, Direction des Eaux et Forêts, Chasses et de la Conservation des Sols/Organe de Gestion CITES au Sénégal

Central, South America and the Caribbean		
Brazil*	Guatemala*	Argentina
<p>Ms. Claudia M. C. de Mello Autoridad Administrativa CITES</p> <p>Claudia M. C. de Mello Diretoria de Uso de Biodiversidade e Florestas Coordenação de Comércio Exterior Coordenadora</p>	<p>Mr. César Augusto Beltetón</p> <p>Scientific Authority CITES Consejo Nacional de Áreas Protegidas</p>	<p>Mr. Daniel Ramadori Autoridad Administrativa CITES</p>
Perú*	Bahamas	Nicaragua
<p>Ms. Irma Betty Romero Rodriguez</p> <p>Autoridad Administrativa CITES</p> <p>Dirección de Gestión Sostenible del Patrimonio Forestal</p>	<p>Ms. Danielle Hanek MSc.Forest Officer</p> <p>Forestry Unit</p> <p>Ministry of the Environment and Housing</p>	<p>Mr. René Salvador Castellón Autoridad Administrativa CITES</p> <p>Ministerio del Ambiente y Recursos Naturales (MARENA)</p>
Programme donor representatives		
European Commission Mr. François Busson Policy Officer - Forestry and Biodiversity European Commission International Cooperation and Development Unit C2 – Environment, Natural Resources, Water		
United States of America Ms. Anne St. John Biologist Division of Management Authority U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service		
CITES TREES SPECIES PROGRAMME TEAM		
Evaluators/Scientists		
Mr. Ian Thompson Thompson Forest Consulting Inc.	Mr. Jorge Malleux Consultor forestal Internacional Profesor Emérito Universidad Nacional Agraria - La Molina Lima Perú	
CITES Tree Species Programme Coordinator and Programme Assistant		
Ms. Milena Sosa Schmidt CITES Tree species programme Coordinator	Ms. Eleonora Palmero Programme Assistant	

Three Regional Coordinators		
<p>Mr. Jean Lagarde BETTI</p> <p>Regional Coordinator for Africa,</p> <p>CITES Tree Species Programme,</p>	<p>Mr. Thang Hooi Chiew,</p> <p>Regional Coordinator for Asia,</p> <p>CITES Tree Species Programme,</p>	<p>Ms. Milena Sosa Schmidt</p> <p>Regional Coordinator for Central and South America and the Caribbean</p>
<p>ITTO Secretariat (<i>ex officio</i>)</p> <p>Mr. Steven E. Johnson</p> <p>Director</p> <p>Division of Trade and Industry</p> <p>International Tropical Timber Organization (ITTO)</p>		
Observers		
<p>Hélène PERIER Forest and Wildlife Policy Officer Unit F3 - Multilateral Environmental Cooperation DG Environment - European Commission Tel + 32 2 299 02 96 Av. Beaulieu 9 - office 3/106 1160 Brussels Belgium Email: Helene.PERIER@ec.europa.eu</p>		
<p>Michaela SCHWEDELER Policy Officer European Commission DG Environment Avenue de Beaulieu 9, 00-24 B-1160 Brussels Email: Michaela.SCHWEDELER@ec.europa.eu</p>		
<p>Ms. Aysha Ghadiali, Policy Analyst Forest Service International Programs One Thomas Circle, NW #400 Washington, DC 20005 United States of America Tel: +1-202-644-4625 Email: ajghadiali@fs.fed.us</p>		

Extra contact

The United States of America has requested that in the event that the Member and the Observer of that delegation are not available, to please contact Mr. Luke Thompson at:

Mr. Luke D. Thompson,

Foreign Affairs Officer

Bureau of Oceans and International Environmental and Scientific Affairs

Office of Conservation and Water (OES/ECW)

U.S. Department of State

Tel: +1-202-647-0658

Email: thompsonld@state.gov

European Union

Dagmar Zíková

CITES Scientific Officer

Unit F3 - Multilateral Environmental Cooperation

DG Environment - European Commission

Tel + 32 2 296 32 93

Av. Beaulieu 9 - office 3/124

1160 Brussels

Email: Dagmar.Zikova@ec.europa.eu

* ITTO member country

Annex IV

Preparation of contracts for funding national projects under the CITES Tree Species Programme (CTSP) - Tracking table – 24 October 2018

Country	Title	CTSP Team			Administrative Services (AST)	Regulatory Services (LAC)
		24-10-2018 Status of the project	Contract Circulated with AST and LAC on	Memo – clearance on <i>Due diligence</i>		
Africa						
Benin - Nigeria - Togo	Sensibilisation et renforcement des capacités pour la gestion durable de <i>Pterocarpus erinaceus</i> (Fabaceae) au Bénin, Nigeria et Togo.	Project to be finalized				
Burundi	Renforcement des capacités des parties prenantes en vue d'une gestion durable de <i>Prunus africana</i> au Burundi.	All requested documents received*	30/08	01/10		18/10
Cameroon	Renforcement des capacités des parties prenantes sur l'élaboration, la mise en œuvre et le suivi des plans de gestion de <i>Prunus africana</i> au Cameroun.	Under discussion				
Côte d'Ivoire	Projet de sauvegarde de <i>Pericopsis elata</i> (Assamela) et de <i>Pterocarpus erinaceus</i> (Bois de vène) en Côte d'Ivoire.	All requested documents received*	03/09	01/10		18/10
Gabon	Assessing the ecological dynamic, conservation status, and trade traceability of Kewazingo (<i>Guibourtia</i> spp.) timber species as first step for making non-detriment findings (NDFs) in Gabon.	All requested documents received*	14/08	02/10		18/10
Kenya, Tanzania, Uganda	Conservation and sustainable management of <i>Osyris lanceolata</i> for economic development in East Africa	All requested documents received*	23/08	01/10		18/10
Madagascar	Gestion durable de la population de <i>Prunus africana</i> de Madagascar : évaluation de stock, agroforesterie, technique de prélèvement et cadre réglementaire	All requested documents received*	13/08	01/10		18/10
RDC	Avis de commerce non préjudiciable de <i>Pericopsis elata</i> , de <i>Guibourtia demeusei</i> et de <i>Prunus africana</i> en République Démocratique du Congo.	All requested documents received*	30/08	02/10		18/10
Asia						
Cambodia	Integrating the Development of Guidelines and Incentives for Piloting of Small-scale Private <i>Dalbergia</i> Plantations with the	All requested documents	17/08	03/10		18/10

	Determination of a Non-detriment Findings Report in Preah Vihear Province in Cambodia.	received*				
Indonesia	Sustainable Management of <i>Dalbergia latifolia</i> in Indonesia.	All documents received* Bank account pending	31/08	03/10		18/10
Malaysia	Reducing Harvesting Pressure on the <i>Aquilaria malaccensis</i> (Thymelaeaceae) Natural Populations in Peninsular Malaysia through the Establishment of Arboreta.	All requested documents received	10/08 - updated version 14/08	04/10	04/10	18/10
Thailand	Development of DNA Markers to Identify the Origin of <i>Dalbergia cochinchinensis</i> Wood in Selected ASEAN Member States.	All requested documents received*	16/08 update on 17/08	03/10		18/10
Vietnam	Strengthening the Management and Conservation of <i>Dalbergia cochinchinensis</i> and other Rosewood Species in Vietnam.	All requested documents received*	14/08	03/10		18/10
Latin America						
Argentina	Bases para la gestión sostenible de la especie <i>Bulnesia sarmientoi</i> “palo santo” en la Región del Gran Chaco de Argentina.	All requested documents received*	14/08	04/10		18/10
Brazil	Rapid-Field Identification of <i>Dalbergia</i> Woods and Rosewood Oil by NIRS Technology.	All requested documents received*	14/08	04/10		18/10
Cuba	Fomento de la capacidad para lograr una más efectiva implementación de la CITES para especies maderables en Cuba.	All requested documents received*	30/08	04/10		18/10
Guatemala	Análisis integral de las especies arbóreas del género <i>Dalbergia</i> y similares a través del laboratorio forense de maderas para el fortalecimiento de la aplicación de la CITES en Guatemala.	All requested documents received*	15/08	05/10		18/10
Guatemala, Nicaragua, El Salvador	Generación de capacidades y lineamientos técnicos de manejo para elaborar dictámenes de extracción no perjudicial orientados a las especies del género <i>Dalbergia</i> en Guatemala, El Salvador y Nicaragua.	All requested documents received*	10/08	05/10		18/10

* Final version of the Project Proposal, Simple due diligence questions, Letters on government officials' salaries.

Internal Agreement with UNEP

Contract	Purpose	Signed on
ICA	Internal Cooperation Agreement - UNEP administers 1 million euros for the Elephant component	28/11/2017

Agreements with ITTO

Contract	Purpose	Signed on
SSFA	Regional Meeting for Asia	01/03/2018
PCA	Regional Meeting for Africa and L.A.	30/05/2018
SSFA	Publications	Draft agreement on 23/10/2018

Regional Meetings

- The Regional Meeting for Asia and the Second

Regional Workshop on the Management of Wild and Planted Agarwood Taxa were organized in Yogyakarta, Indonesia, from 25 to 29 June 2018.

- The Regional Meeting for Central and South America and the Caribbean was organized in Buenos Aires, Argentina from 17 to 21 September 2018.
- The Regional Meeting for Africa will be organized in Dar es Salaam Tanzania from 11 to 15 March 2019.

Advisory Committee meetings

- The first AC meeting was organized in the margins of the 69th meeting of the Standing Committee, in Geneva, Switzerland, on 27 November 2017.
- The second AC meeting was organized electronically from 12 to 15 March 2018.
- The Third AC meeting will be organized, in the margins of the 54th Session of the International Tropical Timber Council and Associated Sessions of the Committees, Yokohama, Japan, on 7 November 2018.