

## 1<sup>st</sup> Advisory Committee Meeting of CITES Tree Species Programme

### Attendees

- The Deputy Head of Unit for Multilateral Environmental Cooperation in DG Environment (European Commission): José Rodríguez Romero;
- The CITES Secretary General: Mr. John Scanlon;
- Chair: Mr. Tom De Meulenaer, Chief of CITES Scientific Services (on behalf of the CITES Secretary General);
- CITES Tree Species Programme Coordinator (Ms. Milena Sosa Schmidt), referred hereinafter as ‘the Coordinator’, Regional Coordinator for Africa (Mr. Jean Lagarde Betti), Regional Coordinator for Asia (Mr. Thang Hooi Chiew), Regional Coordinator for Latin America (Ms. Milena Sosa Schmidt), Programme Assistant (Ms. Eleonora Palmero);
- Asia: Indonesia (Ms. Ratna Kusuma Sari and Mr. Daniwari Widiyanto), Thailand (Ms. Duangduen Sripotar, Alternate Member replacing Viet Nam), Malaysia, (Mr. Zulkepli Abd. Rani, Alternate Member, replacing Cambodia);
- Africa: Gabon (Ms. Aurélie Flore Koumba Pambo), Madagascar (Mr. Eric Naivolala Andrianasolo), Senegal (Mr. Abba Sonko, Alternate Member replacing Côte d’Ivoire);
- Central and South America and the Caribbean: Argentina (Ms. Vanesa Tossenberger), Guatemala (Ms. Ana Silvia Morales), Peru (Ms. Fabiola Rocío Núñez Neyra, Alternate Member replacing Brazil);
- European Union represented by the European Commission (Ms. Héléne Perrier).

### Welcoming remarks

The Deputy Head of the Unit for Multilateral Environmental Cooperation in DG Environment (European Commission), José Rodríguez Romero, opened the Advisory Committee meeting, congratulating the CITES Secretariat for their successful efforts in launching the programme over the last months and the International Tropical Timber Organization (ITTO) for the results achieved during the past years, and stating that the new programme is a great opportunity to continue supporting countries in the sustainable trade and management of CITES-listed tree species.

The CITES Secretary General, John Scanlon, thanked the participants, and stressed that this 1<sup>st</sup> meeting of the Advisory Committee (AC) marks a joint first step towards the robust implementation of the CITES Tree Species Programme, giving the opportunity to learn about progress made by the Secretariat and the programme team, that launched implementation in July 2017.

ITTO is an *ex officio* Member of the Committee. The 53<sup>rd</sup> meeting of the ITTO Council was organized from 27 November to 2 December 2017 and for that reason, ITTO could not be represented at this meeting. The Executive Director of ITTO, Dr. Gerhard Dieterle, sent some words that were distributed to greet the other Committee Members.

1. Confirmation of Chair/rapporteur

The Advisory Committee confirmed the Chair, Mr. Tom De Meulenaer, Chief of CITES Scientific Services

2. Adoption of the agenda

The representative of the European Commission proposed to add the topic 'Visibility' under agenda item 9 on *Any other business*. With this proposed change, the Committee adopted the agenda.

3. Self-introduction of meeting participants

Participants of the Advisory Committee introduced themselves.

4. Advisory Committee: ToRs, membership and *modus operandi*

The Chair introduced the Advisory Committee's Terms of Reference (ToRs - See Annex 1). The Coordinator presented the ToRs to the AC for its revision. The Advisory Committee agreed the Terms of Reference.

5. Briefing on launch of the programme and latest updates

The Coordinator presented the CITES Tree Spp. Programme and briefed the Committee on:

(i) Background

(ii) Programme structure

(iii) Programme's team

(iv) Priority areas of work

(v) Programme roadmaps

The Regional Coordinator for Africa presented an overview of the proposals and work with that region;

The Regional Coordinator for Asia presented an overview of the proposals and work with that region;

The Regional Coordinator for Central and South America and the Caribbean presented an overview of the proposals and work with that region.

(vi) Regional/International workshops

(vii) Criteria for selection of activities for funding

(viii) Implementing Partners: CITES and ITTO – cooperation

The representative of the European Commission stressed the importance to continue the collaboration with ITTO as a key partner. Not only can ITTO be a vehicle in providing further funding to the CITES Tree Species Programme through the ITTO Biennial Work Programme PP-A/52-320

Enhance Collaboration between ITTO and CITES. It also remains a key partner to bring expertise on tropical forest management matters. The Coordinator replied that the CITES Secretariat is in the process of finalizing a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) and three Small Scale Funding Agreements (SSFA), one per Region and on different aspects. The two Secretariats of CITES and of ITTO expect to sign the MoU and three SSFAs early in 2018.

The representative of the European Commission underlined the importance of having two scientists in the Advisory Committee in order to get a more robust scientific review of proposals. Considering that the programme is new and includes not only species that have been listed in CITES for a long time, but also new species included at CoP17, the selection of activities to fund needs a good balance. The representative of the European Commission asked about the recruitment process of the two scientists. The Coordinator replied that the Secretariat is considering a list of 12 candidates recommended by colleagues from other organizations (FAO, ITTO).

Indonesia suggested distinguishing the acronym AC for 'Animals Committee' from AC for 'Advisory Committee' by using 'AdC' for Advisory Committee. This proposal was noted.

6. Pre-selection of project summaries submitted under the first call for proposals made on 16 August 2017 and with deadline on 15 October 2017

The Coordinator explained how project summaries received were evaluated on the basis of the established criteria annexed to the letter of invitation sent on 16 August 2017:

- (i) Original summary proposals
- (ii) Overview of project proposals received
- (iii) Evaluation process
- (iv) Review of pre-selected proposals

After explaining the evaluation process, the Coordinator presented to the AC the list of proposals selected by the CITES Secretariat based on these criteria and on urgent priorities to be funded and implemented, most notably those in the context of the Review of Significant Trade and trade suspensions in vigour. The resulting priority proposals were shown in a green list; a second priority list of proposals that need to wait until further funds are made available were shown in an orange list. (See Annex 2) Finally, all other proposals would be kept for consideration at a further stage if other donors join the Programme, and pending amendments or improvements of the proposals, to be discussed with the proponents.

The Secretariat proposed to merge under a new project some of the projects that otherwise could not be funded due to limited funds. That is the case for the following:

- a Benin, Nigeria and Togo were invited to present a joint project entitled *Sensibilisation et renforcement des capacités pour la gestion durable de Pterocarpus erinaceus (Fabaceae) au Nigeria, Bénin et Togo*;
- b Guatemala, Nicaragua and El Salvador were invited to submit a joint project entitled *Generación de capacidades y lineamientos técnicos de manejo para elaborar dictámenes de extracción no perjudicial orientados a las especies del género Dalbergia y Swietenia en Nicaragua, Guatemala y El Salvador*; and

- c The Democratic Republic of the Congo (DRC) had proposed three projects, each of which went beyond the budget limitations; but since DRC is a priority Party for the European Commission, the Secretariat proposed to invite that Party to prepare a single proposal merging the original ones on *Guibourtia demeusei*, *Pericopsis elata*, and *Prunus Africana*.

The AC agreed on the green list of priority projects to be funded, and noted the efforts of the Secretariat to continue attracting funding for other projects currently listed in the orange list as secondary priorities.

#### 7. Programme finances

The Coordinator presented the budget situation detailed in a table showing the different categories of work/expenditures per year, explaining that not all funding under the CITES Tree Species Programme would be made available during 2018. Considering this, some projects would be financed as funds were made available by the European Commission or by other interested donors.

The Committee took note of the budget situation.

#### 8. Discussion on agenda items 6 and 7

Argentina asked when the next AC meeting would take place and what would be the format to use to prepare full project proposals. The Coordinator explained that all Parties that submitted proposals would receive a response early in December 2017. All Parties that submitted proposals that were selected for funding at this stage would receive an invitation to submit a full project proposal. They would receive the format for the full project proposal at that time.

The representative of Gabon proposed to merge the project from Gabon entitled *Towards formulation of non-detriment findings of Kevazingo in Gabon: differentiation of Guibourtia tessmannii and Guibourtia pellegriniana* with the project from Cameroon entitled *Providing crucial tools for non-detriment findings formulation on Bubinga species in Cameroon – Guibourtia demeusei, Guibourtia pellegriniana and Guibourtia tessmannii*. Both proposals were in the orange list of projects. The Committee noted that the Regional Coordinator will follow up with Gabon and Cameroon about this proposition.

The representative of Gabon stressed that the priority in Gabon is to develop capacity for species identification before taking further steps to make a NDF for species that are not clearly identified. She further explained that the country needs projects to improve skills of local managers.

The representative of Senegal expressed disappointment that no projects from that Party were listed in the green list of priority projects to fund. He further stressed the efforts of that Party in the protection of *Pterocarpus erinaceus* and the work done before, and during the 17th meeting of the Conference of the Parties (Johannesburg, 2016) leading now to the importance of the project from Senegal. The Committee noted the regrets of the representative of Senegal and the Coordinator explained that the CITES Trees Species Programme would continue looking for further donors and funding to assist not only Senegal, but also other Parties that cannot benefit at this stage from the limited available funding under the Programme.

The representative of the European Commission also recognized the efforts made by all Parties. She further noted that some of the projects funded in the past by the ITTO-CITES programme had a strong

scientific component and that it would be now indispensable to ensure that each funded project be connected to operational management and control issues.

The representative of Guatemala expressed agreement with the proposal of merging the projects from that Party, Nicaragua and El Salvador, although he proposed to exclude mahogany. The Regional Coordinator for Central, South America and the Caribbean said that before excluding that species there would be a need to consult with all three proponents and evaluate that option all together.

#### 9. Any other business

##### Visibility:

The Coordinator presented the website page dedicated to the programme.

The representative of the European Commission proposed to publish on the programme website all projects, which would be useful to all interested Parties. She further stressed that the Newsletter was a useful reference to all Participating Parties and donors, as they didn't need to wait for official documents and reports. The Coordinator explained that it is possible that the Newsletter will be incorporated in the website in the section dedicated to news, which could replace the longer version of newsletters. The representative of the European Commission suggested to publish a short document on the ongoing work and results of the projects implemented under the CITES Tree Species Programme that would be useful to all Parties/implementing agencies/partners involved in the Programme. The Coordinator responded that the Secretariat will further consider the matter and keep both options as complementary, i.e. having short news on the website and producing a longer technical Newsletter once or twice a year for those involved in the implementation of the programme and interested in technical details on national activities. In view of the resources available for these type of activities, the Coordinator would need to assess this internally and the AC would be informed of further developments.

#### 10. Time and venue of the 2<sup>nd</sup> Advisory Committee meeting

The Coordinator explained that the Committee will be meeting electronically in February and that it would be invited to do so early in 2018.

#### 11. Closing remarks

The Coordinator and the Chair thanked all participants and closed the meeting.

## CITES Tree Species Programme – Advisory Committee (AC)

### Terms of Reference

#### **1. Mandate and key tasks**

An Advisory Committee is established to support the implementation of the CITES Tree Species Programme and provide non-binding strategic and technical advice.

The tasks of the Advisory Committee will include the following:

- Provide guidance on the roadmaps produced by the regional coordinators.
- Provide advice and input on proposal applications.
- Be informed about and comment on the overall progress of the implementation of programme.
- Discuss issues and challenges identified by the programme team and implementers, and propose remedial actions, as appropriate.

The Advisory Committee's findings and recommendations may be reported by the CITES Secretariat to both donors and to the CITES official bodies.

#### **2. Composition**

The Advisory Committee consists of the following:

- Three Party representatives from each of the three CITES regions concerned by the programme (Africa; Asia; Central and South America and the Caribbean).
- Programme donor representatives
- Two scientists
- CITES Secretary General (Chair)<sup>1</sup>
- CITES Tree Species Programme Coordinator and Programme Assistant (Secretary to the Advisory Committee)
- Three Regional Coordinators
- ITTO Secretariat (*ex officio*).

Effort will be made to ensure that the Advisory Committee remains small and flexible, whilst ensuring effectiveness and regional balance. A minimum of one Party representative from

---

<sup>1</sup> For the entire duration of this project and to be reconsidered at a later stage.

each of the three CITES regions concerned by the programme (Africa; Asia; Central and South America and the Caribbean); one donor, and the CITES Secretariat will form a quorum for conducting physical meetings.

Additional members to the Advisory Committee may join at a later stage by agreement. The number of donors present in each meeting cannot outnumber the number of Party representatives.

All members to the Advisory Committee will contribute on a voluntary basis and will self-finance their participation at physical meetings.

### **3. *Modus operandi***

The Advisory Committee will conduct its work mostly through email exchange. The CITES Tree Species Programme Coordinator will ensure that information is shared among the Advisory Committee members. A dedicated programme webpage will be created and maintained to share relevant programme information and to facilitate communication with the Advisory Committee.

These will be closed meetings. In the case that another Party observer would like to attend a particular meeting, that will need to be considered in advance by the Advisory Committee members and, on a case by case basis.

Subject to financial availability, the Advisory Committee will aim to meet face-to-face on an opportunistic basis in the margins of CITES official and other relevant meetings.

At the beginning of each Advisory Committee meeting, the Chair will present the agenda and invite a round of self-introduction of participants. The assistant of the programme will take notes of discussions and prepare minutes that will be shared with all participants.

Rules of procedure may be adopted, if necessary, to help with a smooth running of each meeting.

## CITES Tree Species programme – priority list

Region	NDFs (including STR countries)	Marking & traceability (including Livelihoods)	Identification	Capacity building (including Governance)	Region-wide technical support activity	TOTAL USD BY REGION
Africa  (Out of 39 proposals from )	# <b>BI</b> Renforcement des capacités des parties prenantes en vue d'une gestion durable de <i>Prunus africana</i>	<b>GA</b> Assessing the ecological dynamic, conservation status, and trade traceability of Kewazingo ( <i>Guibourtia</i> spp.) timber species as first step for making non-detriment findings (NDFs) in Gabon	* <b>KE-TZ-UG</b> Conservation and sustainable management of <i>Osyris lanceolata</i> for economic development in East Africa	+ # <b>MG</b> Gestion durable de la population de <i>Prunus africana</i> de Madagascar : évaluation de stock, agroforesterie, technique de prélèvement et cadre réglementaire	Regional expert consultation on <i>Prunus africana</i>	1,418,158
	+ # <b>CM</b> Renforcement des capacités des parties prenantes sur l'élaboration, la mise en œuvre et le suivi des plans de gestion de <i>Prunus africana</i> au Cameroun			+ <b>DRC</b> Elaboration de l'Avis de Commerce Non Préjudiciable (ACNP) de <i>Guibourtia demeusei</i> , <i>Pericopsis elata</i> et <i>Prunus africana</i> en RD Congo		
	* <b>NG BJ TG</b> Sensibilisation et renforcement des capacités pour la gestion durable de <i>Pterocarpus erinaceus</i> (Fabaceae) au Nigeria, Bénin et Togo			* <b>CI</b> Sauvegarde de <i>Pericopsis elata</i> (Assamela) et de <i>Pterocarpus erinaceus</i> (Bois de vène) en Côte d'Ivoire		

Latin America & the Caribbean (Out of 18 proposals)	+* NI- +* GT-SV Generación de capacidades y lineamientos técnicos de manejo para elaborar dictámenes de extracción no perjudicial orientados a las especies del género <i>Dalbergia</i> y <i>Swietenia</i> en Nicaragua, Guatemala y el salvador	+* BR Rapid-field identification of <i>Dalbergia</i> woods and rosewood oil by NIRS technology	+* GT Análisis integral de las especies arbóreas del género <i>Dalbergia</i> y similares a través del laboratorio forense de maderas para el fortalecimiento de la aplicación de la CITES en Guatemala	CU Fomento de la capacidad para lograr una más efectiva implementación de la CITES para especies maderables en Cuba	Regional expert consultation on extract-producing species	1,108,158
	# AR Bases para la gestión sostenible del palo santo o <i>Bulnesia sarmientoi</i> en la Región del Gran Chaco de Argentina					
Asia (Out of 14 proposals)	+* VN Strengthening the Management and Conservation of Siam-Rosewood ( <i>Dalbergia cochinchinensis</i> ) in Vietnam	TH Assessment of Genetic Diversity and Development of DNA Markers to Identify Species and Origin of <i>Dalbergia</i> spp. Wood and Wood Products in ASEAN	+ ID Sustainable Management of <i>Dalbergia latifolia</i> in Indonesia	+* KH Integrating the piloting of small-scale <i>Dalbergia cochinchinensis</i> (rosewood) private forest plantation registration with forest landscape restoration in Preah Vihear province in Cambodia		850,000
	MY Reducing harvesting pressure on the <i>Aquilaria malaccensis</i> (Thymelaeaceae) natural populations in Peninsular Malaysia through ex-situ programmes					
Global					Analysis of global and regional timber trade patterns International capacity-building work on CITES-listed tree species under CITES	
TOTAL USD	1,250,000	520,000	650,000	730,000		

Symbol Key: # (Currently under RST process, or have conditions/zero quota resulting from RST); + Indicative list of target Parties under the project document. All species are possible candidate species under the project document and those with '\*' appear as key target species.

## CITES Tree Species programme – priority list when further funding is made available

Region	NDFs (including STR countries)	Marking & traceability (including Livelihoods)	Identification	Capacity building (including Governance)	TOTAL USD BY REGION
Africa (Out of 39 proposals)	+** <b>MG</b> Cadre réglementaire et collecte des données biologiques et écologiques de <i>Dalbergia</i> de Madagascar pour la formulation d'ACNP et domestication des espèces présentant un potentiel économique (\$250,000)		<b>GA</b> Towards formulation of non-detriment findings of Kevazingo in Gabon: differentiation of <i>Guibourtia tessmannii</i> and <i>Guibourtia pellegriniana</i> (\$223,275)	<b>CF</b> Appui à la gestion durable de <i>Guibourtia demeusei</i> , <i>G. pellegriniana</i> et <i>Pericopsis elata</i> en République Centrafricaine (\$250,000)	<b>708,275</b>
	+ <b>CM</b> Providing crucial tools for non-detriment findings formulation on Bubinga species in Cameroon – <i>Guibourtia demeusei</i> , <i>Guibourtia pellegriniana</i> and <i>Guibourtia tessmannii</i> (\$234,750)				
Latin America & the Caribbean (Out of 18 proposals)	+ <b>BR</b> Conservación y Manejo de <i>Aniba rosaeodora</i> DUCKE en la Amazonia Brasileña (\$163,000)	* <b>EC</b> Bases para el manejo sostenible y conservación de <i>Swietenia macrophylla</i> King. en Ecuador (\$250,000)	+ ** <b>BR</b> Big-leaf mahogany provenance and timbers identification by NIRS Technology (\$235,000)	+ <b>PE</b> Intercambio de experiencias en manejo y aprovechamiento de especies arbóreas incluidas en los apéndices de la CITES, con la finalidad de asegurar la trazabilidad de los extractos de aceites esenciales que se comercializan (\$180,000)	<b>828,000</b>
Asia (Out of 14 proposals)	+ * <b>ID</b> Assessment on the population distribution and conservation status of Indonesian <i>Taxus</i> spp (\$40,000)	<b>IN</b> Supporting sustainable management of <i>Aquilaria</i> spp in India (\$250,000)	+ <b>VN</b> Application of Molecular Tools in Identification and Tracking of Rosewood Timber in the Indo-Burma Hotspot: Integrating Livelihood Strategies and Gene Conservation (DTreeGene) (\$248,000)		<b>1,025,600</b>
	+ * <b>KH</b> Conservation of <i>Aquilaria crassna</i> Pierre and Capacity Building Development (\$237600)				
<b>TOTAL USD</b>	<b>925,350</b>	<b>500,000</b>	<b>956,275</b>	<b>430,000</b>	

Symbol Key: + Indicative list of target Parties under the project document. '\*\*' possible candidate species under the project document. '\*\*\*' key target species.

Proposals included in this list have one or more of the following weaknesses: 1- contains factual errors or misleading evaluations; 2- co-funding seems too limited or excessive and should be confirmed; 3- the Party has legislation that prohibits export of specimens of the target species; 4- the Party has exhausted the commercial natural populations of the target species; 5- the budget is beyond the limit; 6- partners to the programme have reported concerns about the implementing capacity of the proponent; 7- needs extensive revisions to prepare a robust project document; 8- the Party has submitted numerous proposals; 9- direct benefit to the Party is not clear.